

# Marking the Documents-Study (100)

There are **FOUR PARTS** in the Documents-based question:

## 1. Comprehension (20 marks)

(a) 4 marks + 4 marks

Reference to Ireland (**4 marks**); England and/or Scotland (**4 marks**).

(b) 3 marks + 3 marks

Gladstone's actions: (**3 marks**); Result (**3 marks**)

(c) 6 marks

**To earn 3 marks:** simple description of given picture.

**To earn 6 marks:** political interpretation of the picture.

## 2. Comparison (20 marks)

(a) 10 marks

Answer must refer to **both** documents (**max 5 marks + max 5 marks**)

Mark from 0 to 5 marks in each case according to quality:

Excellent = 5 mks

Very good = 4 mks

Good = 3 mks

Fair = 2 mks

Weak = 0-1 mk

(b) 10 marks

Answer must refer to **both** documents (**max 5 marks + max 5 marks**)

Either A or B (supported by explanation) is acceptable.

Excellent = 5 mks

Very good = 4 mks

Good = 3 mks

Fair = 2 mks

Weak = 0-1 mk

## 3. Criticism (20 marks)

(a) 10 marks

Strength = **max 5 marks**

Weakness = **max 5 marks**

Excellent = 5 mks

Very good = 4 mks

Good = 3 mks

Fair = 2 mks

Weak = 0-1 mk

(b) 10 marks

Two reasons: **max 5 marks + max 5 marks**

Excellent = 5 mks

Very good = 4 mks

Good = 3 mks

Fair = 2 mks

Weak = 0-1 mk

## 4. Contextualisation (40 marks)

In question 4, **MARKING BY PARAGRAPH** begins.

**Cumulative Mark** = Max. 24 marks

**TWO** elements (**strengths** and **weaknesses**)

**If only ONE**, Max. CM = 20 marks

**Overall Evaluation** = Max 16 marks

### Cumulative Mark (CM)

These marks are awarded for **historical content** which is **accu-**

**rate and relevant to the question asked.**

The examiner will divide the answer into **PARAGRAPHS OR PARAGRAPH EQUIVALENTS**.

A paragraph or paragraph equivalent may be one of the following:

- (i) A relevant introduction giving the background situation and/or defining the terms and explaining the approach;
- (ii) An episode, phase or stage in a sequence of events;
- (iii) An aspect of a topic/issue, with supporting factual references;
- (iv) A point in an argument or discussion, with supporting factual references;
- (v) An explanation of a concept or term, with supporting factual references;
- (vi) A number of significant, relevant statements of fact, explanation or comment which, although not connected or related, can be taken together and assessed as a paragraph equivalent;
- (vii) A good concluding paragraph or summation, which is not mere repetition.

(Summation which is mere repetition = max 4 marks)

**Having divided the answer into paragraphs or paragraph equivalents, the examiner will award marks to each paragraph or paragraph equivalent as follows:**

**Excellent:** 11-12 marks

Outstanding piece of analysis, exposition or commentary. Clearly expressed, accurate and substantial information.

**Very good:** 8-10 marks

Very good material, accurately and clearly expressed.

**Good:** 6-7 marks

Worthwhile information, reasonably well expressed.

**Fair:** 3-5 marks

Limited information/barely expressed

**Poor:** 0-2 marks

Trivial/irrelevant/grave errors.

### Overall Evaluation (OE)

In awarding OE, the examiner will consider **how well the candidate deals with the set question**. The following grading table will apply:

Excellent: 14-16 marks

Very good: 11-13 marks

Good: 6-10 marks

Fair: 4-5 marks

Weak: 2-3 marks

Very weak: 0-1 mark

In awarding OE marks, **the examiner should not expect answers of more than 40% in quantity** as regards the answers to the longer topic questions in Sections 2 and 3.

This principle of marking by paragraph (CM and OE) continues throughout Sections 2 and 3. The proportion of CM to OE remains 60/40 throughout the examination paper.

**SECTION 1: DOCUMENTS-BASED QUESTION**

*Ireland: Topic 2*

**Movements for political and social reform, 1870-1914**

Case study to which documents relate:

***The elections of 1885 and 1886: issues and outcomes***

Study the documents opposite and answer the questions below.

- According to document A, why does the case of Ireland differ from that of England and Scotland?
  - As shown in document B, what is Gladstone (in tartan trousers) attempting to do and what is the result?
  - The bearded man shown in document B is Parnell.  
What message does the document convey about his role in events at the time of the 1886 Home Rule Bill? (20)
- How does document A differ from document B in its depiction of the likely outcome of Home Rule and land reform for Ireland?
  - Which document, A or B, do you consider more effective in making its point?  
Explain your answer, referring to both documents. (20)
- What are the strengths and weaknesses of document A as a historical source?
  - Would you agree that document B is not only anti-Home Rule but anti-Irish?  
Give two reasons for your answer. (20)
- What were Parnell's strengths and weaknesses as leader of the Home Rule movement? (40)

**– Document A –**

**An edited transcript of part of W. E. Gladstone's speech introducing the first Home Rule Bill to the House of Commons, 8 April 1886**

The two questions of land and the Irish government are closely connected [because] they are the two channels through which we hope to [get] social order in Ireland.

I come to the basis of the whole [problem]: law is discredited in Ireland [because] it comes to the people in a foreign garb. The case of Ireland is not the same as that of England and Scotland. England, by her own strength, makes her own laws just as independently as if she were not combined with two other countries. Scotland has been allowed [by] this house to make her own laws.

The consequence is that the law in England is felt by the people to be English; the law in Scotland is felt by the people to be Scotch; but the law in Ireland is not felt by the people to be Irish.

[It is] little less than a mockery to be told that [this situation contributes] to the unity of this great, noble, and world-wide empire. Something must be done to restore to Ireland the confidence of the people in the law.

**– Document B –**

**Cartoon (9 June, 1886) from Judy, an anti-Home Rule magazine, on the defeat of Gladstone's Bill the previous day**



1.

(a) Document A suggests that the case of Ireland differs from that of England and Scotland because Ireland unlike England and Scotland, has not been given the power to make her own laws. We can see this in the second paragraph for example; "law is discredited in Ireland because it comes to the people in a foreign garb" i.e. that Ireland does not feel Irish while England makes the Irish laws.  $4+3 = 7$

(b) In Document B, Gladstone is attempting to remove the Liberal Party (stick) from the British Union (wall). It is portraying/suggesting that Gladstone is not unionist and is more interested in Irish affairs.

6

(c) The Document conveys the message that Parnell was advising Gladstone, and this had an effect on the way the Liberal Party operated at the time of the 1886 Home Rule Bill. It shows that Parnell influenced Gladstone.

$3+3 = 6$

19

2.

(a) Document A is a transcript from a part of Gladstone's speech to the House of Commons, where he introduces the First Home Rule Bill (1886). By reading this Document, we get the message that Home Rule or some sort of autonomy is required if Ireland is to remain happily in the British Empire. Gladstone, at the end of the speech, says; "It is little less than a mockery to be told that this situation contributed to the unity of .... worldwide empire." This conveys Gladstone's thoughts on the issue, that such a small issue should cause such a problem in such a powerful empire is ridiculous. Gladstone believes Home Rule will be granted to Ireland.

Document B, however, portrays a different image of the issue of Home Rule. It shows the Union as a strong concrete wall, while portraying Gladstone as attempting to remove the Liberals from the Union. We can see two small men that look poor and homeless, they are Home Rule Bill and Land Bill, which tells us the other side of the argument. It shows us the defeat of Home Rule and Land Reform.

$5+5 = 10$

(b) I believe that Document B is more effective at making the point. Because it is a cartoon, it is very easy to understand; it gives us the ideas and thoughts of those against Home Rule at the time. It is quite descriptive as we can easily tell that the characters are Gladstone and Parnell, and we can see what actions the characters are taking. Document A is also easy enough to understand although not as easy as Document B because it is a transcription from Gladstone's speech, and some of the phrases he uses are quite abstract, especially his last paragraph. This is the reason why I find B easier to understand and therefore more effective than A.

$5+4 = 9$  19

3.

(a) Document A has various strengths and weaknesses as a source. But because it is Gladstone's (a pro-Home Rule believer) own speech, it is obviously biased, as are most sources. It is useful, however, as it gives us an insight into why he felt Ireland should be granted Home Rule.

3+3 = 6

(b) Yes. The first reason why I believe it is also anti-Irish is because of the way Parnell is portrayed. He does not look very respectable and this shows its anti-Irish nature. My second reason for believing that Source B is anti-Irish is because of how the Home Rule Bill and Land Bill are shown to be kicked to the curb, drinking alcohol and wasting away as such. This shows very little respect/care about the Irish issues of the time.

3+4 = 7

13

4. (Parnell is seen today as one of Ireland's heroes.

Parnell was an extremely effective leader when he was in charge of the Home Rule party. Parnell's (and the Home Rule Party's) aims were primarily to gain Home Rule for Ireland, and to solve the Land Question.

Parnell effectively tackled the Land Question in Ireland, and eventually because of his efforts, it was solved. He successfully built the Home Rule Party into a strong, united and extremely disciplined political party. We can see this by examining the "party Pledge", whereby each Party member had to vote in conjunction with the majority in the Party.)

6

(Parnell owes much of his success to his excellent leadership and organisational skills. He successfully raised funds to help the Irish people and to help build the Home Rule Party. He also successfully spread the Home Rule party nationwide; with the help of his "lieutenants" such as Healy and Harrington, who were sent by Parnell to various parts of Ireland to establish branches of the Party.)

5

(One of Parnell's big weaknesses however, was perhaps his confidence and his unwillingness to understand the Unionists' reasons for opposing Home Rule. Parnell, perhaps, could have been a little bit more lenient in his attitude towards the unionists. We can see his confidence and unwillingness in the case of the 1885 and 1886 elections, where he "would not give up a single Irishman.<sup>14</sup> But we can easily see that Parnell's strengths as a leader easily outweighed his weaknesses which is why he was so effective during his time.)

6	CM - 17	19/20	27/40
	OE - 10	19/20	78/100
	<hr/> OM - 27	13/20	

1.

(a) According to Document A Ireland differs from England and Scotland because although it is part of the Empire it has never been allowed to make its own laws. The English make their own laws as do the Scottish but we simply follow the English law. The case of Ireland also differs because we don't feel like this law is Irish, while the Scottish feel their law is their own and so do the English, "but the law in Ireland is not felt by the people to be Irish". We see the English law as "foreign garb" instead of our own.

$$4+4 = 8$$

(b) In Document B Gladstone is attempting to break the union by using the Liberal Party to split it down the middle. It is not working and the home rule and land reform bill are standing idly by which shows how they have been defeated.

$$3+3 = 6$$

(c) The picture seems to say that Parnell is letting Gladstone do all the work with the Liberal party. Gladstone is working very hard at breaking the union while Parnell is not working. His body language in this picture suggests inaction and hesitancy as he is clutching his hat while watching Gladstone from afar.

The message being conveyed is that Parnell is using Gladstone to break the union while he is simply watching and perhaps instructing him from afar as in this drawing. Parnell's role seems to be conveyed as a passive one.

6

20

2.

(a) Document A seems to imply that home rule and land reform are likely to be passed. Gladstone believes it necessary so thinks it must happen "something must be done". It also seems to be saying that the two issues are interlinked so the outcome should be good for both of them. "the two questions of land and the government are closely connected."

Document B does not seem to think that land reform and home rule will happen as the two bills are sitting at the side of the drawing. Parnell is also portrayed as a passive leader which suggests that he might not be an effective person to lead home rule.

$$5+4 = 9$$

(b) I think Document A is more effective at making its point as it compares Ireland's situation to other countries in the empire such as Scotland and France. I think B is less effective at making its point because it is unclear what is happening to the two bills.

$$4+3 = 7$$

16

3.

(a) I think Document A's main weakness is that it is a persuasive account. It is very biased as Gladstone is trying to get home rule so he is arguing the case for Ireland. It gives comparisons but these are to support its point that Ireland should have home rule and land reform and they do not show objectively. "Law is discredited in Ireland".

I feel another weakness of Source A as a historical source is that it overexaggerates the comparison between Ireland, England and Scotland. "Scotland is felt by the Scottish to be Scotch".

The strengths of this document are that it is a secondary source and that it clearly shows Gladstone's point of view in the issue of home rule.

5+3= 8

(b) I think this is anti-Irish as it shows the two home rule bills as leprechauns. They are Irish issues and it shows them as a clichéd Irish stereotype. It also shows Parnell the Irish leader as a passive inefficient man. In comparison to the English leader Gladstone who is working hard in this picture he looks lazy and incompetent. He is also dressed in a stereotypical way.

4+4 = 8

16

4. (Parnell had many strengths. He was a strong leader who had strong beliefs in the necessity for home rule. He was completely behind the movement and this is obvious in his achievements to get it e.g. land reform bill. Parnell was politically minded despite the fact that he only entered politics at the age of 27. He realised at the New Departure that it would be a good idea to use land reform to promote the home rule bill. His party had a wide ranging appeal as there were many tenant farmers who wanted land reform)

7

(He was a determined leader and was unafraid to ally himself with controversial groups such as the obstructionists or the IRB as long as they furthered the aims of the Home Rule movement. He realised that the Obstructionists would get the issue of home rule noticed and that the IRB could provide funding from their Irish American support. He was also quite a flexible leader and reportedly adapted his speech to whatever audience he was addressing. His flexibility was also shown when he wanted the support of the liberals but changed to the conservatives when they came into power.)

9

(Parnell was also an intelligent leader. He was able to get land reform for Ireland through a mixture of obstructionism, manipulation and determination. His weaknesses however include his inability to judge the attitudes of contemporary society, his selfishness and that he didn't stand up for himself. When the fact that he was going out with a married woman, Kitty O'Shea, came to light. He was not worried about his reputation and failed to defend it. When her husband started a divorce case Parnell did not let her have

a defence lawyer and this made him look bad to the public. His weakness is that he allowed his personal life to affect the home rule movement.)

7

(He was also quite dictatorial and when he set up the National League it was actually just him who ran it. This was described as "the enthronement of one man". This was not good for home rule as he was completely responsible for the party and he eventually let his reputation fall into decline. He also dissolved the ladies land league as he wished to be the only leader of the movement. This could have opened home rule up to more people, women, but that didn't happen.)

6

CM - 26

OE - 13

---

OM - 39

20/20

16/20

16/20

---

39/40

91/100